

Historic, Archive Document

Do not assume content reflects current scientific knowledge, policies, or practices.





Research Note

LIBRARY
CURRENT SERIAL RECORD

JUN 27 1946

NORTHERN ROCKY MOUNTAIN FOREST AND RANGE EXPERIMENT STATION

Missoula, Montana

U.S.D.A., NAL

OUT 08 1946

CATALOGING PREP

No. 44

June 5, 1946

DIRECT SEEDING WESTERN WHITE PINE -- FIFTH-YEAR RESULTS

By Austin E. Helmers

This report summarizes the results of a series of direct seeding experiments with western white pine after five growing seasons. Initial establishment of the seedlings during the first two to three growing seasons, experimental methods, and detailed descriptions of the areas, have been related in earlier reports by Schopmeyer (2,3,4) and McKeever (1).

The first series of plots, composed of seed spots, were sown in the fall of 1937 and spring of 1938 on level benches and north slopes which had been clearcut and broadcast burned within the previous year or two. The early results showed that fall sowing gave better initial establishment than spring sowing. Hence, the follow-up work reported here deals only with tests in which the seeds were sown during the fall. Covering the seed spots with conical wire screens during the first year to protect them from seed-eating rodents caused highly significant increases in seedling establishment. Therefore, seed spotting with western white pine as a means of reforesting new burns on north slopes or level benches appeared to have considerable promise when the seeds were fall-sown and given protection from rodents.

Seedling survival on the early tests has decreased very little in subsequent years. Five years after establishment 78 percent of the screened spots supported one or more seedlings (Table 1). Stocking on unscreened spots was much less satisfactory, only 27 percent. The number of seedlings per stocked spot averaged 6.6 on screened spots, four times as many as on unscreened spots.

Table 1.--Stocking of fall-sown western white pine on screened^{1/} and unscreened seed spots at end of fifth growing season

Location of Area	Description of Area	Rodent Protection	Fifth-year stocking	
			Stocked spots ^{2/}	Seedlings per stocked spot
			Percent	Percent
Kalispell Creek, Kaniksu N. F.	:Level bench, clearcut and broadcast burned :fall of 1936	:Screens :None	: 72 : 25	: 7.0 : 1.6
Kalispell Creek, Kaniksu N. F.	:Level bench, clearcut and broadcast burned :fall of 1936	:Screens :None	: 86 : 13	: 6.9 : 1.5
Sands Creek, Coeur d'Alene N.F.	:North slope, clearcut and broadcast burned :fall of 1937	:Screens :None	: 60 : 31	: 5.3 : 1.5
Solitaire Creek, Coeur d'Alene N.F.	:North slope, clearcut and broadcast burned :fall of 1937	:Screens :None	: 96 : 40	: 7.3 : 1.7
Average		:Screened	: 78	: 6.6
Average		:Unscreened	: 27	: 1.6

1/ The screens were removed one year after seed sowing.

2/ Spots with one or more live seedlings.

Poisons for Rodent Control

The experiments with conical wire screens showed clearly that protection from seed-eating rodents must be provided. However, screens are too cumbersome and expensive for use in large-scale reforestation projects. Hence, experiments in the use of poisons for rodent control were undertaken using poisoning methods developed by the U. S. Fish and Wildlife Service.

The methods tested were (1) poisoning with thallium sulphate-coated hulled sunflower seed placed in small piles at intervals of 15 to 20 feet, using one pound of bait per acre, about one week before sowing the tree seed; and (2) sowing tree seeds coated with a mixture of yellow dextrine, plaster of Paris, cornmeal, and strychnine alkaloid. The two poisoning methods were tested separately and in combination.

The areas where poisoning was studied ranged in size from 10 to 50 acres. The tests were initiated partly in the fall of 1938 and partly in the fall of 1939.

Stocking at the end of five growing seasons was practically the same on

1. The first part of the document is a list of names and addresses of the members of the committee.

2. The second part of the document is a list of names and addresses of the members of the committee.

3. The third part of the document is a list of names and addresses of the members of the committee.

4. The fourth part of the document is a list of names and addresses of the members of the committee.

5. The fifth part of the document is a list of names and addresses of the members of the committee.

6. The sixth part of the document is a list of names and addresses of the members of the committee.

7. The seventh part of the document is a list of names and addresses of the members of the committee.

8. The eighth part of the document is a list of names and addresses of the members of the committee.

9. The ninth part of the document is a list of names and addresses of the members of the committee.

10. The tenth part of the document is a list of names and addresses of the members of the committee.

11. The eleventh part of the document is a list of names and addresses of the members of the committee.

12. The twelfth part of the document is a list of names and addresses of the members of the committee.

13. The thirteenth part of the document is a list of names and addresses of the members of the committee.

areas prepoisoned and sown with poisoned seed as on areas prepoisoned but sown with unpoisoned seed (Table 2). On the area that was not prepoisoned but was sown to poisoned seed, fifth-year stocking was relatively low.

Table 2.--Fifth-year stocking of direct-seeded white pine using poisons for rodent control

Location of Area	Description of Area	Poisoning Method	Fifth-year stocking	
			Stocked spots	Seedlings per stocked spot
			Percent	Number
Sands Creek, Cocur d'Alene National Forest	Northwest-facing ridge top, clearcut and broadcast burned in 1938.	Prepoisoned, poisoned seed	79	3.4
Kalispell Creek, Kaniksu National Forest	North slope clearcut and broadcast burned in 1939.	Prepoisoned, poisoned seed	67	4.1
Kalispell Creek, Kaniksu National Forest	Level bench clearcut and broadcast burned in 1938.	Prepoisoned, poisoned seed	67	3.2
Average		Prepoisoned, poisoned seed	71	3.6
Kalispell Creek, Kaniksu National Forest	North slope clearcut and broadcast burned in 1939.	Prepoisoned, unpoisoned seed	70	3.4
Kalispell Creek, Kaniksu National Forest	North to northwest slopes clearcut and broadcast burned in 1939.	Not pre-poisoned, but poisoned seed	41	2.5

These experiments show that satisfactory stocking can be obtained in direct seeding white pine if seeds are protected from rodents by prepoisoning the area about one week before seeding. Stocking on prepoisoned areas compared reasonably well with that obtained by the use of screens for rodent protection. It appears that poison-coated seeds do not alone provide adequate rodent protection. When used in conjunction with prepoisoning it contributed little to the effectiveness of control.

Broadcast vs. Spot Sowing

Broadcast and spot seeding have been compared in only one test, established in the fall of 1939 on a north-facing slope on Honey Creek, Cocur d'Alene National Forest. The tract had been clearcut and prescribed broadcast burned in 1939. The seeding areas were poisoned about one week prior

to seed sowing. Approximately 20 poisoned seeds per spot were sown in seed spots spaced at 8-foot intervals or about 14,000 seeds per acre. Broadcast sowing was done by hand, also using poisoned seed, at the rate of 50,000 seeds per acre.

At the end of the fifth year, 47 percent of the seed spots were stocked. Stocking on the broadcast-sown area was 73 percent on the basis of 64-square-foot units (the equivalent of 8 x 8 spacing). There were 497 stocked sampling units per acre on the broadcast-sown area and 320 stocked spots per acre on the spot sowing. Broadcast sowing, although seemingly of promise, has not been tested sufficiently to warrant conclusions.

Seed Spotting on an Administrative Scale

Ninety-seven acres on Honey Creek were sown to white pine in the fall of 1940 as a test of direct seeding on an administrative scale. The test area, with north and east exposures, was clearcut and broadcast burned in 1939. The area was prepoisoned, using one-half pound of bait per acre. Seed spots with a 7.5-foot spacing were sown with approximately 27 poison-coated seeds per spot, although 15 to 20 seeds was the intended rate. The same area was planted with 2-2 white pine stock in the spring of 1942.

The stocking percentage of the seed spotting increased from 61 percent the first year to 62 percent the fifth year, and the number of live seedlings per stocked spot increased from 2.2 to 3.0, due to delayed germination. After one growing season, survival on the planting was 98 percent.

The five-year-old seedlings are now firmly established. However, the nursery transplant trees, although field planted $1\frac{1}{2}$ years later, have the advantage in height as compared with the seedlings from the spot sowing. The nursery-grown seedlings also have the advantage of being distributed singly rather than in groups like some of the trees in seed spots.

Nursery-grown trees excel in initial rate of growth, adaptability to a wider range of planting conditions, distribution of the trees, and probability of successful establishment in years of subnormal moisture.

Comparative Costs of Direct Seeding and Tree Planting

Costs and production rates on the larger-scale seeding tests indicated that the initial costs of seed spotting about equalled those for tree planting on comparable sites.

The labor for preparing and planting a seed spot was practically the same per spot as for planting a tree. The principal time element in the preparation of a seed spot was that involved in "scalping" (removing the humus and roots from an 18-inch circle of soil with a hazel hoe). Average, well-trained workers can plant about 700 trees or seed spots per 8-hour day on the freshly burned areas where direct seeding has the greatest promise.

Seed used in spot sowing had practically the same value as the numbers

of 2-0 nursery-grown white pine trees needed to reforest equal areas. However, seed is considerably less expensive than 2-2 white pine, the class of nursery stock usually preferred for field planting. White pine seed for sowing 800 spots per acre costs \$3.34 (0.835 lb. at \$4.00). Eight hundred 2-0 white pine seedlings cost \$3.60 and the same number of 2-2 white pine stock costs \$7.20, delivered to the planting site. Seed costs could be reduced by sowing fewer spots. However, seedling establishment records indicate this may not be safe.

Broadcast sowing results in a considerable saving of labor, but requires the use of almost 4 times as much seed as spot sowing.

Prepoisoning preparatory to direct seeding required about 2 man-hours of labor per acre. The bait used cost about 25 cents per acre. Spreading poison bait is an added cost of direct seeding that tends to offset savings made over the use of planting stock.

CONCLUSIONS

These experiments show that reforestation of white pine by sowing seeds in spots can be successfully accomplished when adequate protection from seed-eating rodents is provided and the sowing done in the fall on newly burned north slopes and flats. Poisoning the areas with one pound of thallium sulphate-coated hulled sunflower seeds per acre one week before sowing appears to provide the necessary protection. Although a test of broadcast sowing resulted in better stocking than seed spotting in that particular instance, broadcast sowing must be more thoroughly tested before conclusions can be made. Seed spot sowing was successfully accomplished on an administrative scale at about the same cost as that of planting nursery transplant stock.

REFERENCES

1. McKeever, D. G. 1942.
Direct seeding of western white pine using poisons for rodent control. Northern Rocky Mountain Forest and Range Experiment Station, Missoula, Montana. Research Note No. 18.
2. Schopmeyer, C. S. 1939.
Direct seeding in the western white pine type. Northern Rocky Mountain Forest and Range Experiment Station, Missoula, Montana. Applied Forestry Notes No. 90.
3. _____ 1940.
Successful forestation by direct seeding using poisons for rodent control. Northern Rocky Mountain Forest and Range Experiment Station, Missoula, Montana. Research Note No. 1.
4. _____ 1940.
Second-year results of direct-seeding experiments in the western white pine type using screens for rodent control. Northern Rocky Mountain Forest and Range Experiment Station, Missoula, Montana. Research Note No. 6.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100

101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200

201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300

301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400

401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500

501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600

601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
698
699
700

701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
798
799
800